



## Dental Hygiene Board of California Education Committee Meeting Minutes

**Saturday, November 8, 2025**

DHBC Headquarters Building  
2005 Evergreen Street  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor Hearing Room  
Sacramento, CA 95815

### **Education Committee Members Present:**

Chair – Joanne Pacheco, Registered Dental Hygienist (RDH) Educator Member  
Committee Member – Michael Long, Registered Dental Hygienist in Alternative Practice (RDHAP)  
Committee Member – Dr. Justin Matthews, Public Member

### **DHBC Staff Present:**

Anthony Lum, Executive Officer  
Adina A. Pineschi-Petty, Doctor of Dental Surgery (DDS), Education, Legislative, and Regulatory Specialist  
Crystal Yuyama, Administrative Analyst  
Yuping Lin, Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA) Legal Counsel  
Elizabeth Dietzen-Olsen, DCA Regulatory Legal Counsel

### **1. EDU Committee Agenda Item 1: Roll Call and Establishment of a Quorum.**

Joanne Pacheco, Education Committee Chair, called the Education Committee meeting to order at **10:59 a.m.** A quorum was established with three (3) members present.

### **2. EDU Committee Agenda Item 2: Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda.**

**Committee Member comment:** None.

**Public comment:** None.

### 3. EDU Committee Agenda Item 3: Discussion and Possible Action on the Report from the Dental Hygiene Educational Program Penalty Rubric Taskforce.

Chair Pacheco reported that the Board is mandated by the Legislature to approve all California dental hygiene educational programs (DHEPs) for oversight. When the Board started reviewing the DHEPs, the Board was aware there might be some concerns as to the level of compliance with California laws, regulations, and Commission on Dental Accreditation of the American Dental Association (CODA) Standards, but was not aware of the extent of the issues that were present until the Board began its site visits and observed what practices were occurring and as to the level of non-compliance within the DHEPs.

Due to the variance and extent of violations, and the desire to ensure penalties are applied evenly among the DHEPs, at the March 22, 2025, Full Board meeting, the Board voted to create a penalty rubric to allow the Board to be fair and consistent to all DHEPs. The Board appointed Board members Joanne Pacheco and Julie Elgner as co-chairs of the DHEP Penalty Rubric Taskforce. After the meeting, the Taskforce co-chairs received requests from three interested stakeholders who were appointed to the taskforce based on their qualifications. These experts were JoAnn Galliano, Dr. Michelle Hurlbutt, and Lisa Kamibayashi who have extensive DHEP experience and knowledge of the subject to create an appropriate penalty rubric.

Since the Taskforce conducted their first meeting on June 4, 2025, the Taskforce has met seven (7) times and categorized the violations utilizing the factors as outlined in 16 CCR section 1104.3 which include:

- Nature and severity of the violation;
- Length of time that has passed since the date of the violation;
- Consequences of the violation, including the potential to harm, or actual patient harm;
- History of previous violations of similar nature;
- Evidence that the violation was willful;
- Gravity of the violation; and
- The extent to which the cited DHEP has remediated the deficiencies.

Along with categorizing the aforementioned factors, the Taskforce discussed the frequency of violations discovered at DHEPs along with discussions on timeframes and penalties DHEPs shall be given to remediate violations and deficiencies providing structure to a potentially perceived subjective determination.

The next Taskforce meeting is scheduled for November 21, 2025, and continued meetings will occur until a draft rubric is ready for the committee's review.

**Motion:** Member Matthews moved for the Education Committee to approve the Report from the Dental Hygiene Educational Program Penalty Rubric Taskforce.

**Second:** Member Long.

**Committee Member discussion:** Executive Officer (EO) Lum commended the Taskforce on all their hard work and efforts to draft the penalty rubric.

**Public comment:** None.

**Vote: Motion for the Education Committee to approve the Report from the Dental Hygiene Educational Program Penalty Rubric Taskforce.) Passed 3:0:0.**

Name	Aye	Nay	Abstain/Absent
Joanne Pacheco, Chair	X		
Michael Long	X		
Justin Matthews	X		

**4. EDU Committee Agenda Item 4: Discussion and Possible Action on Board Acceptance of the Revised Accreditation Nomenclature Pursuant to the United States Department of Education.**

EO Lum stated that this item was brought up at today’s Legislative and Regulatory Committee on pages 10 through 38. He stated that this item was included as an agenda item separately to allow the Education Committee an opportunity to vote on the statutory language to be changed as it is a topic relevant to dental hygiene education.

**Motion:** Member Long moved for the Education Committee to review the amended statutory language to re-affirm the change is warranted. If the Education Committee re-affirms the change is warranted, the Education Committee shall recommend to the Full Board to re-affirm and approve the final draft of the proposed statutory language amendment for BPC section 1941, and direct staff to seek sponsored legislation for 2026.

**Second:** Member Matthews.

**Committee Member discussion:** None.

**Public comment:** None.

**Vote: Motion for the Education Committee to review the amended statutory language and re-affirm the change is warranted. If the Education Committee re-affirms the change is warranted, the Education Committee shall recommend to the Full Board to re-affirm and approve the final draft of the proposed statutory language amendment for BPC section 1941, and direct staff to seek sponsored legislation for 2026. Passed 3:0:0.**

Name	Aye	Nay	Abstain/Absent
Joanne Pacheco, Chair	X		
Michael Long	X		
Justin Matthews	X		

**5. EDU Committee Agenda Item 5: Dental Hygiene Educational Program Site Visit Update and Schedule. (Informational Only).**

Dr. Adina Petty reported on the current status of the following DHEPs at Pasadena City College (PCC), Taft College (Taft), Concorde Career College-San Diego (CCC-SD), Cerritos College (Cerritos), Concorde Career College-Garden Grove (CCC-GG), Concorde Career College-San Bernardino (CCC-SB), West Coast University (WCU), and Diablo Valley College (DVC).

Dr. Petty also shared the upcoming Dental Hygiene Educational Program (DHEP) site visit schedule.

**Committee Member comment:** Chair Pacheco thanked Dr. Petty presenting her report and for her hard work in conducting DHEP site visits.

Most of the committee member discussion centered on concerns regarding Diablo Valley College (DVC) and their reported site visit information. Member Long initially stated he is concerned with DVC’s direct patient contact hours and National Board Exam performance. The discussion also presented the issue of language used by Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) when defining the standard of direct patient care as it uses “should” statements as this is a concern for Board staff and the Committee members if it is interpreted as recommended and not mandatory. Dr. Petty recommended the Board revisit this topic as a future agenda item to hold programs accountable to a minimum standard of direct patient care hours. Member Matthews suggested a taskforce be formed to identify “should” statements in the CODA Standards and documents, and then assess each instance the word is used. The EO suggested that the Board host another townhall meeting to get buy-in from the program educators and gather their feedback on the matter.

Member Long asked DVC Program Director Tonette Steeb about one of the violations they received concerning students having to provide their own personal protection equipment (PPE), including masks, gloves, and gowns. Program Director Steeb referred to a section of law that allows vocational programs to charge students a fee for equipment. Dr. Petty stated that the section of law is being misinterpreted by DVC and explained that PPE should be provided by schools unless the students can take the equipment with them.

**Public comment:** Tooka Zokaie, on behalf of the California Dental Association (CDA), supported the suggestion of a townhall meeting to hear more from educators and their view on how this may affect their student’s ability to pass all requirements and examinations, as

well as any other challenges that may affect graduating dental hygienists entering the workforce.

Tonette Steeb, Program Director for Diablo Valley College (DVC), addressed the Education Committee’s recent comments and concerns regarding the schedule changes affecting the direct patient care hours and adjustments made to their curriculum and their National Board Exam passage rates. Program Director Steeb stated the program has taken steps to improve student performance across clinical and didactic areas. She shared the program strongly values having the clinical assistant rotation included in the curriculum to reinforce infection control concepts for public safety and stated that the program did not have any recommendations during their CODA site visit.

**6. EDU Committee Agenda Item 6: Discussion and Possible Action on the July 19, 2025, Education Committee Meeting Minutes.**

**Motion:** Member Matthews for the Education Committee to approve the July 19, 2025, Education Committee Meeting Minutes.

**Second:** Member Long.

**Committee Member discussion:** None.

**Public comment:** None.

**Vote: Motion for the Education Committee to approve the July 19, 2025, Education Committee Meeting Minutes. Passed 3:0:0.**

Name	Aye	Nay	Abstain/Absent
Joanne Pacheco, Chair	X		
Michael Long	X		
Justin Matthews	X		

**7. EDU Committee Agenda Item 7: Future Agenda Items.**

**Committee Member comment:** Chair Pacheco recommended a town hall meeting for program directors to discuss the educational standards required by the Dental Hygiene Board of California (DHBC). This recommendation was supported by Member Matthews. Chair Pacheco also recommended the Education Committee assemble a taskforce to address the concerns of the DHBC educational requirements. Chair Pacheco added that the taskforce should be created after the town hall meeting is held and when the Committee members agree.

**Public comment:** None.

**8. EDU Committee Agenda Item 8: Education Committee Adjournment.**

Chair Pacheco adjourned the Education Committee at **11:41 a.m.**